### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN

ROB BINTER JR.,

Plaintiff,

Case No. 23-cv-1063-LA

ν.

Judge Lynn Adelman

UNITED HEALTHCARE SERVICES, INC.,

**CLASS ACTION** 

Defendant.

#### **JOINT RULE 26 REPORT AND DISCOVERY PLAN**

The Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 16(b) scheduling conference will be held on November 20, 2023 at 9:30 a.m. Plaintiff Rob Binter Jr. ("Plaintiff") and Defendant United HealthCare Services, Inc. ("Defendant") submit the following Rule 26 report pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26 and Civil Local Rule 16:

- **A.** The nature of the case: This is a putative class action in which Plaintiff alleges Defendant violated the Telephone Consumer Protection Act by making prerecorded voice calls to Plaintiff and others without consent.
- **B. Any contemplated motions**: Plaintiff intends to move for class certification at the appropriate time and may move for summary judgment.

  Defendant will oppose class certification and will likely move for summary judgment.

C. The parties' discovery plan, including the amount of discovery each party contemplates, the approximate time for completion of discovery, and any disputes regarding discovery:

## 1. Completion of Discovery and Phasing of Discovery

a. The parties propose that all discovery on the subjects identified below, and any subjects that the parties later identify, be completed by February 28, 2025.

#### 2. Subjects of Discovery:

a. <u>Plaintiff</u>: Plaintiff anticipates serving an initial round of written discovery directed primarily towards Defendant's defenses to Plaintiff's claims and identifying all parties involved in the making of calls by or on behalf of Defendant, including information relating to the content, creation, and instructions to make the calls, as well as information sufficient to identify the recipients of those calls. This written discovery will seek information maintained by Defendant or by any agent of Defendant. Plaintiff will also seek related information from any third-party marketers or others involved in the making of the calls. Plaintiff then intends to depose Defendant relating to its defenses, prerecorded voice call

practices, and the calls at issue, and serve additional written discovery as necessary. Finally, Plaintiff intend to obtain written discovery regarding, and the depositions of, any experts retained by Defendant in connection with Plaintiff and the Class's claims.

- b. <u>Defendant</u>: Defendant anticipates serving written discovery on Plaintiff and third parties concerning Plaintiff's allegations in the Complaint. Defendant further anticipates deposing Plaintiff and other individuals regarding the telephone calls at issue and consent provided thereto. Defendant also intends to obtain written discovery regarding, and the depositions of, any experts retained by Plaintiff in connection with Plaintiff's and the putative class's claims.
- 3. Disclosure, Discovery, or Preservation of Electronically Stored Information: The parties anticipate the need for electronic discovery and will confer to try to reach agreement regarding an ESI Protocol. If the parties are unable to reach agreement, the parties shall submit a joint motion for ESI Protocol to highlight any unresolved issues.

- 4. Claims of Privilege or of Protection as Trial Preparation

  Materials: The parties do not anticipate any issues regarding claims

  of privilege or of work product protection. The parties have not yet

  reached agreement on a procedure to assert claims of privilege or

  work product after production but will continue to discuss this issue

  as discovery proceeds.
- **5. Limitations of Discovery**: The parties do not believe, at this time, that any changes should be made in the limitations on discovery imposed under the Federal Rules or Local Rules. The parties reserve the right to request changes to discovery limitations pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(1).
- **6. Other Rule 16(b), 16(c), or 26(c) Orders**: There are no other orders that the Court should currently issue under Rules 16(b), 16(c) or 26(c).
- **D.** Whether the parties anticipate the disclosure or discovery of electronically stored information: The parties anticipate discovery of electronically stored information and will confer to try to reach agreement regarding an ESI Protocol. If the parties are unable to reach agreement, the parties shall submit a joint motion for ESI Protocol to highlight any

- unresolved issues. The parties reserve the right to request changes to discovery limitations pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(1).
- E. Whether the parties have reached an agreement for asserting postproduction claims of privilege or of protection as trial-preparation
  material, and whether the parties request the judge to enter an order
  including the agreement: The parties do not anticipate any issues
  regarding claims of privilege or of work product protection. The parties
  have not yet reached agreement on a procedure to assert claims of privilege
  or work product after production but will continue to discuss this issue as
  discovery proceeds.
- **F. Whether settlement discussions have occurred**: The parties will engage in future good faith discussions at the appropriate time. Plaintiff anticipates requiring call logs for the class in order to appropriately evaluate the action prior to meaningful settlement discussions.
- G. The basis for the Court's subject matter jurisdiction: This Court has federal question subject matter jurisdiction over this action under 28 U.S.C. § 1331, as the action arises under the Telephone Consumer Protection Act, 47 U.S.C. §227.

- H. Whether this case is exempt from initial disclosures and discovery conference requirements: This case is not exempt from initial disclosures and discovery conference.
- I. Such other matters as may affect further scheduling of the case for final disposition: The parties agree to electronic service of all documents not required to be filed with the court electronically, provided they are sent to all attorneys of record in the lawsuit.
- **J.** <u>Proposed Deadlines</u>: The parties propose the following schedule for the Court's consideration.

EVENT	PROPOSED DEADLINE
Initial Disclosures	November 16, 2023
Joinder of any additional parties	December 29, 2023
and filing of motion to amend the	
complaint	
Fact discovery shall be completed	July 19, 2024
by	
Plaintiff's Motion for Class	July 26, 2024
Certification with any Expert	
Reports in Support Thereof	
Defendant's Response/Opposition	September 13, 2024
to Plaintiff's Motion for Class	
Certification filed with any	
Rebuttal Expert Reports in Support	
Thereof	
Plaintiff's Reply in Further Support	October 4, 2024
of Class Certification filed with	
any Expert Reports in Support	
Thereof	

EVENT	PROPOSED DEADLINE
The parties shall disclose initial	January 10, 2025
experts, expert witness summaries,	
and reports as required by Fed. R.	
Civ. P. 26(a)(2) by	
The parties shall disclose rebuttal	February 7, 2025
experts, expert witness summaries,	
and reports as required by Fed. R.	
Civ. P. 26(a)(2) by	
Expert discovery shall be	February 28, 2025
completed by	
Dispositive motions, including	March 21, 2025
summary judgment, shall be filed	
by	
Joint pretrial stipulation and	June 13, 2025
pretrial motions	

DATED this 13th day of November, 2023.

Respectfully submitted,

By: /s/ Avi R. Kaufman
Avi R. Kaufman (FL Bar no. 84382)
kaufman@kaufmanpa.com
KAUFMAN P.A.
237 South Dixie Highway Floor 4
Coral Gables, FL 33133
Telephone: (305) 469-5881

Stefan Coleman law@stefancoleman.com Coleman PLLC 66 West Flagler Street, Suite 900 Miami, FL 33130

Mailli, FL 33130 Telenhone: (877) 33

Telephone: (877) 333-9427 Facsimile: (888) 498-8946

Attorneys for Plaintiff and the putative Class

By: /s/ Carolyn A. DeLone
Adam K. Levin
Carolyn A. DeLone
Katherine I. Culora
adam.levin@hoganlovells.com
carrie.delone@hoganlovells.com
katherine.culora@hoganlovells.com
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP
555 13th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20004
Telephone: (202) 637-5600
Facsimile: (202) 637-5910

Joseph S. Goode
Benjamin W. Kuhlmann
JGoode@llgmke.com
BKuhlmann@llgmke.com
LAFFEY, LEITNER & GOODE LLC

325 E. Chicago Street, Suite 200

Milwaukee, WI 53202 Telephone: (414) 312-7003

Facsimile: (414) 755-7089

Attorneys for Defendant United HealthCare Services, Inc.

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I served the foregoing pleading via the Court's electronic filing system, pursuant to the Electronic Filing Procedures, on the attorneys of record.

This the 13th day of November, 2023.

/s/ Avi R. Kaufman

Avi R. Kaufman